# Planetary climate systems

### Inner edge of habitable zone

- Water loss limit Escape of water/hydrogen to space
- Runaway greenhouse limit
  Complete evaporation of ocean



NASA/JPL-Caltech

 $\rightarrow$  How/when did **Venus** lose water and get the thick CO<sub>2</sub> atmosphere ?

### Outer edge of habitable zone

- Greenhouse effect by CO<sub>2</sub> and other gases
- Enhancement of cloud albedo in cold, massive atmospheres
- $\rightarrow$  How/when did **Mars** lose thick atmosphere and freeze ?

## Runaway greenhouse effect



Figure 13.7 Diagram illustrating the positive feedback loop caused by water vapor.

Catling & Kasting (2017)

- An increase in surface temperature causes an increase in atmospheric water vapor, which then increases the greenhouse effect, causing a further increase in surface temperature. (Positive feedback)
- A wet atmosphere makes spectral atmospheric windows close up, and thermal infrared radiation cannot escape to cool the planet. If the absorbed solar flux exceeds the outgoing infrared limit, the surface water totally evaporates and the planet's surface heats up.

## Runaway/moist greenhouse of early Venus



Albedo = 0.22 is assumed



FIG. 6. Temperature versus pressure for selected runaway greenhouse atmospheres. The lower portions of the curves represent dry adiabats. The curve(s) to which they are all joined are moist pseudoadiabats, which are very nearly equivalent to the saturation vapor pressure curve for water.

## Could ancient Venus be habitable ? (Way et al. 2016)



- Low CO<sub>2</sub> density like Earth is assumed, with CO<sub>2</sub> being fixed in the crust as carbonate rocks.
- Global mean surface air temperature of 11°C despite an incident solar flux at Venus's orbit ~46% higher than that received by modern Earth
- The dayside of the planet is almost completely cloudy, as a result of this world's slow rotation which generates a strong circulation with rising motion and accompanying high thick clouds on the dayside.



subsolar-to-antisolar circulation (Y. Matsuda)

#### Habitable zone for tidally-locked exoplanets (Yang et al. 2014)



#### Rotation period >> Radiative relaxation time

(Earth : 100 Earth days)



Subsolar-to-antisolar circulation

(松田 2000)

#### Rotation period << Radiative relaxation time

(Venus : 50 Earth years)



Axi-symmetric circulation

# Ancient Martian climate: clue to the outer edge of the habitable zone





Valley network distribution (Ramirez & Craddock 2018)



# Three possibilities

- The greenhouse effect was bigger in the past because of a thicker atmosphere that contained higher concentrations of greenhouse gases.
- The fluvial features were caused by many temporary warm episodes associated with impacts. The energy released from impacts would have heated the surface of early Mars, vaporized ice into steam, and produced rainfall that eroded river valleys.
- The fluvial features were produced in a rather cold environment. Fluvial erosion might be produced in response to fortuitous combinations of orbital parameters, allowing localized snowmelt. Brines can exist as liquids at temperatures below 273 K.

(Catling and Kasting 2017)

#### Can the ancient Mars be warm with CO<sub>2</sub> greenhouse effect ? Kasting (1991)

- The ancient Sun was 25% dimmer than the present
- CO<sub>2</sub> greenhouse has been expected to warm the ancient Mars
- Warm lower atmosphere causes convection, which induces condensation of CO<sub>2</sub> in the upper atmosphere. The associated latent heating raises the temperature at upper levels, and at the same time cools the lower atmosphere so that the net energy balance is maintained.

## Effect of CO<sub>2</sub> condensation



 $\rightarrow$ When the solar constant is less than 86% of the present value, the surface temperature cannot exceed 273 K.



 $CO_2$  ice clouds traveling above the Mars Curiosity rover on December 12th, 2021

Forget & Pierrehumbert (1997)

- CO<sub>2</sub> ice clouds scatter infrared radiation emitted from the surface, thereby causing greenhouse effect.
- CO<sub>2</sub> ice clouds also have cooling effect via increase of the planetary albedo. However, thick CO<sub>2</sub> atmosphere itself has a high albedo even when no cloud exists, and thus the effect of cloud albedo is relatively minor.
  - For example, cloud-free 2-bar  $CO_2$  atmosphere has an albedo of 0.38. Addition of  $CO_2$  clouds increases the albedo to 0.65, thereby reducing the solar absorption by 40%. At the same time the clouds absorbs 60% of the infrared radiation emitted from the surface.



**Fig. 2.** Calculated mean temperature profiles for a 2-bar CO<sub>2</sub> atmosphere, assuming a 25% reduced solar luminosity corresponding to the early Mars conditions. The effect of the cloud from Fig. 1 ( $\tau = 10, r = 10 \,\mu$ m) is shown in the cases of a wet (fully saturated troposphere; dashed curves) and a dry (solid curves) atmosphere. The dotted curve shows the CO<sub>2</sub> condensation temperature profile.

#### 3D modelling of the early Martian climate under a denser CO<sub>2</sub> atmosphere: Temperatures and CO<sub>2</sub> ice clouds (Forget et al. 2013)

- 3D global climate simulations of the early martian climate performed assuming a faint young Sun and a CO<sub>2</sub> atmosphere with surface pressure between 0.1 and 7 bars
- Previous studies had suggested that CO<sub>2</sub> ice clouds could have warmed the planet thanks to their scattering greenhouse effect. However, even assuming parameters that maximize this effect, it does not exceed +15 K. As a result, a CO<sub>2</sub> atmosphere could not have raised the annual mean temperature above 0 deg C anywhere on the planet.
- This is consistent with a cold early Mars scenario in which nonclimatic mechanisms must occur to explain the evidence for liquid water.

## Mean surface temperature vs. Surface pressure (column CO<sub>2</sub> amount)

- Surface temperature increases up to 2 bar. Above 2– 3 bar, bar Rayleigh scattering by CO<sub>2</sub> gas more than compensates for the increased thermal infrared opacity of the atmosphere. Increasing the atmospheric thickness does not result in an increase of the mean surface temperature.
- Taking into account the radiative effect of CO<sub>2</sub> ice clouds results in a global warming of the surface by more than 10 K resulting from the CO<sub>2</sub> ice cloud scattering greenhouse effect.
- The collapse of the atmosphere into permanent CO<sub>2</sub> ice caps is predicted for higher pressures.



Fig. 1. Global mean annual mean surface temperature (K) as a function of surface pressure in our baseline simulations (obliquity =  $25^{\circ}$ , [CCN] =  $10^{5}$  kg<sup>-1</sup>, circular orbit) with and without radiatively active CO<sub>2</sub> ice clouds.

An example of the instantaneous CO<sub>2</sub> ice clouds coverage for a mean surface pressure 2 bar



- CO<sub>2</sub> ice clouds cover a major part of the planet but not all. Their behavior is controlled by a combination of large scale ascents and descents of air, stationary and travelling waves, and resolved gravity waves related to the topography.
- The mean cloud warming remains lower than 15 K because of the partial cloud coverage and the limited cloud optical depth.

# Other greenhouse gases?

- Ammonia (NH<sub>3</sub>): 500 ppm of NH<sub>3</sub> in a 4–5 bar CO<sub>2</sub> atmosphere could raise surface temperatures to 273 K. However, NH<sub>3</sub> is photochemically unstable and would require shielding to survive.
- Methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) : even at concentrations of 500 ppm CH<sub>4</sub> does not significantly boost the greenhouse effect of a pure CO<sub>2</sub>/H<sub>2</sub>O atmosphere. CH<sub>4</sub> would require strong sources to sustain the above concentrations.
- Sulfur dioxide (SO<sub>2</sub>) & hydrogen sulfide (H<sub>2</sub>S) : An obvious source for these gases is volcanic activity. SO<sub>2</sub> needs to build up to concentrations around the 10 ppm level or higher. SO<sub>2</sub> readily converts to aerosols, and these aerosols should have a net cooling effect on surface temperatures. Furthermore, SO<sub>2</sub> is highly soluble and will washout quickly when conditions become warm enough for rainfall.

(Forget et al. 2013)

# H<sub>2</sub>-CO<sub>2</sub> greenhouse ? (Ramirez et al. 2014)



Collision-induced absorption (CIA) band of  $H_2$  caused by the foreign-broadening by the background  $CO_2$  atmosphere

Reduced mantle conditions could have favored enhanced outgassing of  $H_2$  over long timescales. Hydrogen is continuously replenished by volcanism that offsets losses to space.

An atmosphere containing -4 bar of  $CO_2$  and 5% H<sub>2</sub> would have brought Mars' average surface temperature up to the freezing point of water.

## recurrent slope lineae

 transition between different climate regimes ?











Steffen et al. (PNAS, 2018)



## Milankovitch cycles on Mars and Earth

Table 12.10 The orbital elements of Mars and the Earth and their variability.

Parameter	Present Mars	Martian variability			Terrestrial variability	
		Range	Cycle (years)	Present Earth	Range	Cycle (years)
Obliquity (°)	25.19	0-85*	120 000**	23.45	22-24	41 000
Eccentricity	0.093	0-0.12	120 000***	0.017	0.01-0.04	100 000
Longitude of perihelion (°)	250	0-360	51 000	285	0-360	21 000

\* Before ~10 Ma, obliquity variations are chaotic. While unpredictable at an exact time, statistically they would have varied between 0 and 85° (Laskar *et al.*, 2004; Touma and Wisdom, 1993).

\*\* The amplitude of obliquity oscillation is modulated with a ~1.2 Myr period envelope.

\*\*\* The amplitude of eccentricity oscillation is modulated with a ~2.4 Myr period envelope.

Catling & Kasting 2017

## Milankovitch cycles on Mars



Laskar et al. (2002)



- low obliquity → cold pole → massive polar cap → dry atmosphere
  → retreat of ice sheet
- high obliquity → warm pole → thin polar cap → moist atmosphere
  → growth of ice sheet, ice accumulation in the tropics

# **Buried glaciers**





# Formation of glaciers on Mars by atmospheric precipitation at high obliquity Forget et al. (2006)

• The model predicts ice accumulation in regions where glacier landforms are observed, on the western flanks of the great volcanoes and in the eastern Hellas region

